Univerzitet u Sarajevu Filozofski fakultet Odsjek anglistika

# Završni diplomski rad

A Game of Thrones – Comparative Analysis of Translation Strategies (English – Serbian and Croatian) / Igra tronova/prijestolja – Uporedna analiza prevodilačkih strategija (engleski – srpski i hrvatski)

Mentor: doc.dr. Amira Sadiković

**Student:** Nermina Hanjalić - Brown

Sarajevo, juni 2016.

University of Sarajevo Faculty of Philosophy English Department

# Master's Thesis

A Game of Thrones – Comparative Analysis of Translation Strategies (English – Serbian and Croatian)

Mentor: doc.dr. Amira Sadiković

**Student:** Nermina Hanjalić - Brown

Sarajevo, June 2016

# CONTENTS

Abstract1	
1.	Creation of a fantasy world2
1.1.	About "A Game of Thrones"5
1.2.	English as a global language6
2.	Word composition in service of translation8
2.1.	Toponyms11
2.2.	Multi-word toponyms11
2.3.	Compounds as place-names14
2.4.	SF characters16
2.5.	Conclusion19
3.	Personal names and titles19
3.1.	Footnotes
3.2.	Descriptive personal names24
3.3.	Titles
4.	Formal vs. dynamic equivalence
4.1.	The strength of <i>seem</i> and <i>make</i> in translation
4.2.	Damage caused by the formal equivalence translation
4.3.	Conclusion
5.	Tackling idiomatic expressions
5.1.	Conclustion47
6.	Tenor of discourse    48
6.1.	Conclusion
7.	Conclusion
Biblie	ography

#### Abstract

The aim of this paper is to compare various translation strategies employed in George R.R. Martin's first book in "A Song of Ice and Fire" saga – "A Game of Thrones", as translated into the Croatian language by Tatjana Pavičević, and into the Serbian language by Nikola Pajvančić.

After a brief introduction of the author and the novel, the paper will move on to the English language as the global language of today, as well as its influence on the lexis and syntax of smaller languages.

The paper will then focus on the multi-level analyses of the two translations, starting from the lexical meaning of the novel specific terms and coins, as well as their structure and meaning within their respectful contexts. The aim of the comparison is to see to what extent the translations manage to achieve equivalence on the word level within the structure of the items chosen for the discussion.

After analysis on the word level, the paper will deal with syntactic analyses where selected examples will demonstrate different translation strategies in handling the English language sentence structure in terms of formal and dynamic equivalence. This will further develop into semantic analysis of idiomatic expressions, their interpretation, and the strategies of their translation.

And finally, the tenor of discourse, which is the most general aspect of this research, will be analyzed in terms of the cultural differences between the English and the Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian language.

Key words: word structure, coins, formal, dynamic, idiomatic expressions

#### 1. Creation of a fantasy world

"Long ago, in a time forgotten, a preternatural event threw the seasons out of balance. In a land where summers can last decades and winters a lifetime, trouble is brewing. The cold is returning, and in the frozen wastes to the north of Winterfell, sinister and supernatural forces are massing beyond the kingdom's protective Wall."<sup>1</sup>

All the way back in 1991, inspired by history and politics of the world we have been living in for millennia now, George R.R. Martin decided to start creating a world of his own, a world consisting of its own landscapes, people, languages, laws, and politics, a world that in so many aspects resembles ours, and still, so different from ours. One of his famous quotes on the world of fantasy is:

"... We read fantasy to find the colors again, I think. To taste strong spices and hear the songs the sirens sang. There is something old and true in fantasy that speaks to something deep within us, to the child who dreamt that one day he would hunt the forests of the night, and feast beneath the hollow hills, and find a love to last forever somewhere south of Oz and north of Shangri-La."<sup>2</sup>

The passion with which George R.R. Martin speaks about fantasy as opposed to reality, his dream world and his storytelling fortunately ended up on hundreds of pages of one of the most intriguing, attention-catching, highly addictive novels of the modern times. At this stage, the destinies of Martin's characters are fairly uncertain because the story has not come to an end yet. Millions of readers, who read the epic saga's first five parts ("A Game of Thrones", "A Clash of Kings", "A Storm of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A Game of Thrones (A Song of Ice and Fire, Book One), *George R.R. Martin*, 2015. Web. 24<sup>th</sup> February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.georgerrmartin.com/grrm\_book/a-game-of-thrones-a-song-of-ice-and-fire-book-one/> <sup>2</sup> George R.R. Martin Quotes (Author of A Game of Thrones), *Goodreads Inc*, 2015. Web. 25<sup>th</sup> February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.goodreads.com/author/quotes/346732.George\_R\_R\_Martin>

Swords", "A Dance With Dragons", and "A Feast for Crows"), have been patiently waiting for its conclusion which the author has been delaying for a long time now.

The author found his inspiration in Tolkien's "The Lord of the Rings" saga, and the medieval history of England, namely, the War of the Roses, the times when chivalry, bravery, and honor were still the main ethical principles governing the world. According to "The New Encyclopaedia Britannica", "in ancient times war was not subject to any control other than that exercised by the combatants themselves, and any limitations that they might have placed on their own actions on the battlefield would have been due to military necessity rather than any belief that to attack civilians or to kill prisoners of war was wrong – let alone illegal"<sup>3</sup>. Indeed, the author's imaginary society and the wars they lead between each other greatly reflect the cruelty of warfare during medieval times. What the author does not fail to achieve is the element of surprise in almost every single chapter of the series. In one of his interviews, after being asked whether "A Game of Thrones" might have been a reimagination of the Wars of the Roses, George R.R. Martin stated:

"I did consider at a very early stage – going all the way back to 1991 – whether to include overt fantasy elements, and at one point thought of writing a Wars of the Roses novel. But the problem with straight historical fiction is you know what's going to happen. If you know anything about the Wars of the Roses, you know that the princes in the tower aren't going to escape. I wanted to make it more unexpected, bring in some more twists and turns."<sup>4</sup>

In order to create the "twists and turns" in this intriguing story, G.R.R. Martin introduces some new terms which originate from the old ones the readership is already familiar with from their every day speech (e.g. dragon+glass=*dragonglass*<sup>5</sup> "a common name in Westeros for the substance known as obsidian, a form of volcanic glass. Along with Valyrian steel, it is one of the two known substances capable of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "The Theory and Conduct of War", *The New Encyclopaedia Britannica. Macropaedia*, Vol. 29, 15th edit., 2005., 633.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Mikal Gilmore, "George R.R. Martin: The Rolling Stone Interview". *Rolling Stone*, 2014. Web. 13th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.rollingstone.com/tv/news/george-r-r-martin-the-rolling-stone-interview-20140423>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> George R.R. Martin, A Game of Thrones (A Song of Ice and Fire, Book One), (New York: Bantam Books, 2011), 616.

killing White Walkers<sup>5</sup>; green+seer=*greenseers*<sup>7</sup> "name for the wise men of the children of the forest who had magical abilities that included power over nature and prophetic visions<sup>8</sup>; shadow+cat=*shadowcats*<sup>9</sup> "fearsome predators, but will also scavenge. They have thick black fur with white stripings, in size they are between real world tigers or mountain lions<sup>10</sup> etc.). Obviously, his strongest tools in the creation are coined words he uses to name the new places, characters, objects, and creatures. The power of these words lays in their simplicity and picturesqueness, their descriptive value and vividness.

"Words are wind" is one of Martin's favorite phrases he keeps repeating over and over again in this saga ("Wind and words. Wind and words."<sup>11</sup> "In the end words are just wind"<sup>12</sup>, "Words are wind, you know, and you've blown mine away with your good sense."<sup>13</sup>, "Words are wind. If you love me, do not leave me"<sup>14</sup> etc.). For such windy things, words seem to carry a lot of force resulting in a piece of modern times classic millions of readers are addicted to.

Inspired by the huge readership of G.R.R. Martin's "A Song of Ice and Fire" saga throughout the world, the HBO created a fantasy drama TV series called "A Game of Thrones" which premiered in April 2011 in the USA.

For better understanding of the analyses, the following chapter provides a brief introduction with the structure, as well as the plot of the novel.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Dragonglass, *Game of Thrones Wiki*, 2014. Web. 21st September 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://gameofthrones.wikia.com/wiki/Dragonglass>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> George R.R. Martin, op.cit., 617.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Greenseer, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2014. Web. 21st September 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Greenseer>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> George R.R. Martin, op.cit., 240.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Shadowcat, *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2014. Web. 21st September 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Shadowcat>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> George R.R. Martin, op.cit., 552.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> George R.R. Martin, A Clash of Kings (A Song of Ice and Fire, Book Two), (New York: Bantam Books, 2011), 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> George R.R. Martin, *A Storm of Swords (A Song of Ice and Fire, Book Three)*, (New York: Bantam Books, 2011), 604.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> George R.R. Martin, *A Feast for Crows (A Song of Ice and Fire, Book Four)*, (New York: Bantam Books, 2011), 192.

#### 1.1. About "A Game of Thrones"

"A Game of Thrones" is the first in "A Song of Ice and Fire" series. The continent of Westeros is a federation of seven kingdoms (Winterfell or Kingdom of the North, the Kingdom of Mountain and Vale, the Kingdom of the Isles and Rivers, the Kingdom of the Rock, the Kingdom of the Reach, the Kingdom of the Stormlands, and Dorne)<sup>15</sup> ruled by King Robert Baratheon. Upon the death of Lord Jon Arryn, who was the Hand of the King (chief advisor and the executor of the King's command)<sup>16</sup>, the King and his retinue arrive to Winterfell to offer its ruler, Lord Eddard (Ned) Stark, to serve as his replacement, which he unwillingly accepts.

Eddard and Catelyn Stark have five children together: Robb, Sansa, Bran, Arya, and Rickon, but Eddard also has a bastard son Jon Snow who is not welcome by Catelyn therefore he must join the Night's Watch, a military order on the Wall protecting the realm from strange creatures. Each one of their children, including Jon, has a companion direwolf to follow them and to protect them.

After Bran, an experienced wall-climber, mysteriously falls off a wall and falls into coma, Eddard leaves for the King's Landing, the capital of Westeros, and, motivated by his son's unfortunate condition (paralyses), starts investigating the death of Lord Jon Arryn. Eddard finds out that Lord Arryn was killed because he knew a secret: Prince Joffrey Baratheon is not Robert's son, but the son of the Queen Cersei and her twin brother Jaime Lannister. At the same time he finds out that Bran was pushed off the wall he was climbing by Jaime Lannister after he had seen him making love with the Queen.

From that moment on, all hell breaks loose. The Queen starts conspiring against the Starks, and keeps their daughter Sansa (who is supposed to marry Prince Joffrey) a captive. She also imprisons Eddard Stark. Prince Joffrey takes the throne and sentences him to death. In return, Lady Catelyn Stark kidnaps her midget brother Tyrion and takes him to her sister's castle. The Starks start falling apart.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> A Wiki of Ice and Fire: A Song of Ice and Fire & Game of Thrones, *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2015. Web. 27<sup>th</sup> February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Seven\_Kingdoms>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Ibid.

At the same time, in the East, "Viserys Targaryen, son of the king overthrown by Robert Baratheon, betroths his sister Daenerys to Khal Drogo, a warlord of the nomadic Dothraki, in exchange for use of Drogo's army to reclaim the throne of Westeros".<sup>17</sup>

## 1.2. English as a global language

Nowadays, the worldwide influence of the Anglo-American culture through media, literature, and migrations has had a huge impact not only on the B/C/S language, but also on other languages spoken in the world. All languages are subject to changes and the English language, as the global language of today, is not spared from the changes itself.

The British linguist David Crystal, writing about the consequences of global English, states:

"When a language adopts words, and also sounds and grammatical constructions, it adapts them."  $^{18}\,$ 

He quite rightfully believes that no language community has ever succeeded in stopping this process in taking place regardless of the fact that purists believe this process to be leading to a disaster.<sup>19</sup>

We quite naturally adopt English words through Anglo-American media, huge film production, video games, advertisements, education, etc., and use them in our every day speech until they officially become a part of our lexis. In this sense, we speak about loanwords, the "words taken into a language from another language (the term borrowing is used for the process). Most obviously, this occurs when new things come into speakers' experiences as the result of contacts with speakers of other

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> A Game of Thrones, *Wikipedia*, 2015. Web. 9<sup>th</sup> March 2015. <a href="http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A\_Game\_of\_Thrones">http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A\_Game\_of\_Thrones</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> David Crystal, *Part one: Language and Intercultural Communication. The consequences of global English.* (PDF), n/a. Web. 22nd March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt; www.davidcrystal.com/?fileid=-4074>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Ibid.

languages. This is a part of the history of every language, except for one spoken by an impossibly isolated community."<sup>20</sup>

The English grammatical constructions do not easily penetrate into another language, and in terms of translation, one should bear in mind Mona Baker's assertion that "the syntactic structure of a language imposes certain restrictions on the way messages may be organized in that language. The order in which functional elements such as subject, predicator, and object may occur is more fixed in some languages than in others."<sup>21</sup>

In terms of syntax, the word order in the English language is one of the major factors, which signals the relationship between clause elements. "A simple sentence consists of a single independent clause, which may be one of seven types. The types differ according to whether one or more clause elements (cf 2.3) are obligatorily present (cf 10.4) in addition to the S(ubject) and V(erb)...

- 1. SV The sun (S) is shining (V).
- 2. *SVO* That lecture (S) bored (V) me (O).
- 3. *SVC* Your dinner (S) seems (V) ready (C).
- 4. *SVA* My office (S) is (V) in the next building (A).
- 5. SVOO I (S) must send (V) my parents (O) an anniversary card (O).
- 6. *SVOC* Most students (S) have found (V) her (O) reasonably helpful (C).
- 7. SVOA You (S) can put (V) the dish (O) on the table (A)."<sup>22</sup>

On the other hand, the B/C/S language is highly inflectional; therefore it is more flexible and liable to the influence of the English language sentence structure patterns. "Confusing source and target language patterns is a pitfall that can easily be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> "Language", *The New Encyclopaedia Britannica. Macropaedia*, Vol. 22, 15th edit., 2005., 561.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Mona Baker, *In Other Words* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), 110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Sidney Greenbaum, Randolph Quirk, A Student's Grammar of the English Language (London: Longman, 1991), 204.

avoided once the translator is alerted to the potential influence that the collocational patterning of the source text can have on him/her."<sup>23</sup>

In terms of translation, what we get as a result is English being spoken or written through the words of B/C/S which, despite of the flexibility of the latter, produces robust and unnatural utterances which interfere with the receptor's stream of thought. Mona Baker quite clearly emphasizes the importance of the word order in translation and draws a parallel between the English and the Russian language (which can also apply to the B/C/S language in this context):

"Some languages have **case inflections** which indicate the relationship between the elements in a clause, for instance who does what to whom. In such languages, the form of a noun changes depending on its function in the clause. In Russian, both *Ivan videl Borisa* and *Borisa videl Ivan* mean 'John saw Boris' (Lyons, 1968), because -a marks Boris as the object, regardless of its position with respect to the subject and verb... Word order is extremely important in translation because it plays a major role in maintaining a coherent point of view and in orienting messages at text level."<sup>24</sup>

The importance of the word order can further be accentuated by the 18<sup>th</sup> century thinkers who saw that "man's rationality developed and still goes hand in hand with his use of language, and a good deal of the flexibility of languages has been exploited in man's progressive understanding and conceptualizing of world he lives in and of his relations with other men."<sup>25</sup>

#### 2. Word composition in service of translation

G.R.R. Martin's fantasy world is mostly created of meaningful multi-word and compounded nouns, as well as single-word nouns with connotations hidden behind their meanings. The author coins them in order to name the places on his map, his people, as well as his herbs, his animals, food, etc. The deceiving simplicity by which

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Mona Baker, *op.cit.*, 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ibid., 110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> "Language", *The New Encyclopaedia Britannica*. Macropaedia, Vol. 22, 15th edit., 2005., 561.

he builds his world hides complications, which arise from the context of the novel. Therefore, the author's coins simply invite to be translated because they represent "reality" which is foreign even to the SL readers.

The subject of this chapter is the extent to which the translators manage to translate or transcribe the author's coins, as well as to take a look at the possibility of retaining their form in the TL.

The development of compounds in B/C/S language depends on certain conditions. Primarily, the compounded elements must have had a firm syntactical connection and be in use, as such, for a long period of time. Secondly, the connection between the compounded elements must evoke a new meaning compared to their individual ones. And, thirdly, the compounded elements, in many cases, change their rhythm, tone, and intensity. It is quite interesting that orthography of the compounds varies throughout these languages, and that there is no clear-cut rule which could unify them in this matter (e.g. Bosnian orthography: *žiroračun*, Croatian orthography: *žiro-račun*, Serbian orthography: *žiro račun*).<sup>26</sup>

Similar is the case with the English language compounds:

"In linguistics, a compound is a lexeme (less precisely, a word) that consists of more than one stem. Compounding or composition is the process of word formation that creates compound lexemes... That is, in familiar terms, compounding occurs when two or more words are joined to make one longer word. The meaning of the compound may be very different from the meanings of its components in isolation."<sup>27</sup>

It can be concluded that the development of compounds has taken similar course in both English and B/C/S language.

In this context, it is also interesting to analyze the category of proper nouns in the form of compounds and the ways they make their place in the story. As it will be seen from the examples that follow, the author combines them in order to create

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, Bosanski, hrvatski, srpski aktuelni pravopisi: (sličnosti i razlike) (Sarajevo: Bosansko filološko društvo), 2005), 151-152.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Compound, *Wikipedia – The Free Encyclopedia*, 2015. Web. 16th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://en.wikipedia.org9wiki/Compound\_(linguistics)>

concepts, which reveal their main features. In order to convey these properties, our translators had no choice but to translate or, rarely, to transcribe the compounded proper nouns following the orthographic rules of their respective languages.

The Croatian language orthography prescribes that the personal nouns from languages which use the Latin alphabet be written in their original forms. On the other hand, the Serbian language, which mostly uses the Cyrillic alphabet, prescribes their transliteration thus adjusting them to their own phonemic orthography. Since the Serbian language uses the Latin alphabet too, transcription is the way to bring the foreign proper nouns closer to the Serbian language speakers.<sup>28</sup>

The importance of context in the process of translation of these structures must not be neglected in such a broad peace of literary work. The approach to this problem greatly depends on the translators themselves, and in this sense, they can take two different courses in considering the context as an important decision making strategy in translation: the bottom-up, and the top-down approach.

Although she prefers the bottom-up approach to translation which "starts with simple words and phrases rather than with the text as situated in its context of culture"<sup>29</sup>, Mona Baker also promotes Hatim and Mason's model of translation process, which "adopts a top-down approach, taking such things as text-type and context as starting points for discussing translation problems and strategies. The top-down approach is the more valid one theoretically, but for those who are not trained linguists it can be difficult to follow: there is too much to take in all at once."<sup>30</sup>

The selected examples enlisted in this chapter will try and prove the importance of context in translation, as well as the top down approach while tackling these concepts in an attempt to "draw" a replica of this fantasy world in the minds of the TL readers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, op.cit., 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit., 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ibid.

#### 2.1. Toponyms

"Toponym is the general term for any place or geographical entity." <sup>31</sup> Different cultures name their places in different ways, but what is important for this study are the semantically transparent place names invented by G.R.R. Martin, as well as their structural complexity as the basis for their translation.

Mila Stojnić considers the formation of geographical names a special category in translation studies. The most widely spread strategy in dealing with this problem is transcription of the place-names into the TL. On the other hand, she also suggests that translating of the geographical terms is quite justified in case that they bear a meaning which is important for understanding their contents (e.g. Arc de Triomphe – Kapija pobjede, Notre Dame – Bogorodičina crkva, etc.).<sup>32</sup> When G.R.R. Martin's fantasy is in question, translating geographical names in not optional but necessary and, as Mila Stojnić said, quite justified because all of them bear certain meanings which need to find their substitutes in the TL thus reproducing, as closely as possible, the picturesqueness from the SL text.

#### 2.2 Multi-word toponyms

Casterly Rock (G.R.R. Martin: 24) Bacačeva hrid (T. Pavičević: 35) Livačka stena (N. Pajvančić: 30)

*Casterly Rock* is a fortress beside the Sunset Sea. "Legend says that Casterly Rock is named for the family that ruled it in the Age of Heroes, the Casterlys, who no longer exist."<sup>33</sup> The Croatian *Bacačeva hrid* found its equivalent in the English noun *caster*, "a person who casts something or a machine for casting something"<sup>34</sup>, whereas *Livačka stena* in the Serbian translation *lijevati* corresponds to the English verb *to* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Toponymy, Wikipedia – The Free Encclopedia, 2015. Web. 17th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt; https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Toponymy>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Mila Stojnić, *O prevođenju književnog teksta* (Sarajevo: Svjetlost, 1980), 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Casterly Rock, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2015. Web. 7th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Casterly\_Rock>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Apple Dictionary /caster/

*cast*, "shape metal or other material by pouring it into a mould while molten"<sup>35</sup>. It is quite clear from the context that *Casterly* is a family name. Its translation in either one of the TL texts is not relevant for the context therefore it should have been copied across either in its original form "Casterly", or with slight orthographic adjustments in the Serbian translation "Kasterli".

*King's Landing* (G.R.R. Martin: 24) *Kraljev grudobran* (T. Pavičević: 35) *Kraljeva Luka* (N. Pajvančić: 30)

*King's Landing* is the capital of Westeros "located on the north bank of the mouth of the Blackwater Rush". One of the definitions of landing is "a place where persons or goods are landed"<sup>36</sup>, which implies that the capital is a harbor where the Serbian *Kraljeva Luka* achieves equivalence both on the word and the structural level. This is not the case with the Croatian *Kraljev grudobran*. Firstly, because the meaning of *grudobran* is "battlement, breastplate, bulwark"<sup>37</sup>, so that equivalence on the word level is not achieved, and secondly, because the B/C/S language orthographic rules prescribe that all words in a multi-word place-name, with the exception of prepositions and conjunctions, are to be capitalized<sup>38</sup>. Consequently, Kraljev grudobran implies the name of a battlement rather than a capital city.

Visenya's hill (G.R.R. Martin: 143) vysenijsko brdo (T. Pavičević: 178) Visenijino brdo (N. Pajvančić: 139)

The city of King's Landing covers the North shore of the Blackwater Rush and three hills named after the first king on the Iron Throne Aegon Targaryen, and his

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Apple Dictionary /cast/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Landing – definition of landing, *The Free Dictionary*, HarperCollins Publishers, 2009. Web. 27<sup>th</sup> February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.thefreedictionary.com/landing>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> EUdict∠grudobran∠Croatian – English dictionary, *EUdict.com by Tomislav Kuzmić*, 2015. Web. 27th February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.eudict.com/?lang=croeng&word=grudobran>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, op.cit., 55.

sisters Visenya and Rhaenys.<sup>39</sup> This information is essential for proper interpretation of the first element of the name. While the Croatian translator substitutes the possessive adjective Visenya's with an –s genitive *vysenijsko*, the Serbian translator opts for the possessive adjective as in the form of the original and substitutes it with *Visenijino*. Beginning with a lower case letter in the Croatian translation, *vysenijsko* implies a common noun with no meaning in the target language. Additionally, the reason why the Croatian translator moves the position of *y* in vysenijsko forward remains a mystery.

*The Blackwater Rush* (G.R.R. Martin: 141) *Bujica Crnovoda* (T. Pavičević: 175) *Crnobujica* (N. Pajvančić: 137)

*"The Blackwater Rush* is a river in the southern Riverlands and the Crowlands... King's Landing, the seat of the Iron Throne, is situated at the mouth of the Blackwater Rush at Blackwater Bay."<sup>40</sup> The Croatian translator makes permutation of the words in the multi-word river name, *Bujica Crnovoda*, which is stylistically more acceptable than Crnovoda Bujica. This would, indeed, sound too simple in the target language, so that this stylistic modification, which does not change the author's intentions, remains a good decision in this particular case. On the other hand, the structural compounding pattern in the service of the word coinage (to be discussed in the next chapter) greatly contributes to the Serbian translator's decision to substitute the multi-word name with a compound *Crnobujica*. This strategy does not disturb the author's patterning system he employs for the word coinage.

Wheel Tower (G.R.R. Martin: 656)Mlinska kula (T. Pavičević: 789)Kula točka (N. Pajvančić: 609)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> King's Landing, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2015. Web. 8th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/King's\_Landing>">http://awoiaf.westeros.php/King's\_Landing>">http://awoiaf.westeros.php/King's\_Landing>">http://awoiaf.westeros.php/King's\_Nading</awoiaf.php/King's\_Nading</awoiaf.php/King's\_Nading</awoiaf.php/King's\_N

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Blackwater Rush, *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2014. Web. 8th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Blackwater\_Rush>

**Wheel Tower** is a part of Riverrun castle ruled by House Tully for a thousand years. It has "a great waterwheel within it, which is turned by the Tumblestone whose waters go through it. It has ivy climbing alongside it, below one makes a wide turn and ends up in churning waters.<sup>41</sup>" The Serbian translator achieves equivalence on the word level, **Kula točka**, but the translation suffers a loss of the focus, which is in the original text placed on the "tower" rather than the "wheel". However, by substituting "wheel" for the more specific term "mlin", more precisely *Mlinska kula*, the Croatian translator achieves a more precise equivalence on the semantic level.

#### 2.3. Compounds as place-names

Seaguard (G.R.R. Martin: 239) Morska straža (T. Pavičević: 296) Vodogled (N. Pajvančić: 227)

*Seaguard* is the name of "a castle in the Riverlands... located north of Riverrun, on the coast of Ironman's Bay"<sup>42</sup>. It is a place where the sea is watched over in order to protect the land from possible battleship attacks. The Croatian *Morska stražarnica* is a literal translation of the source language imaginative compound. It reads relatively well, but it does not contribute to the structure of the coinage. Although the Serbian translation *Vodogled* does not achieve equivalence on the word level with its choice of words in the target language merged together into a compound, it conveys the real purpose of the castle: watching the water.

Lannisport (G.R.R. Martin: 382) luka Lannis (T. Pavičević: 466) Lanisgrad (N. Pajvančić: 360)

Similar to *Seaguard* is the translation of *Lannisport*, "a walled city in the westerlands ruled by House Lannister of Casterly Rock... It is one of the major ports

<http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Riverrun>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Riverrun, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2014. Web. 9th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Seaguard, *Game of Thrones Wiki*, Wikia TV. Web. 1st March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://gameofthrones.wikia.com/wiki/Seagard>

of the Seven Kingdoms and is the largest settlement in the Westerlands<sup>43</sup>." The translators' creativity takes two different courses: the loss of structure in the Croatian translation *luka Lannis*, compared to a partial loss of equivalence on the word level in the Serbian *Lanisgrad*. However, the loss of equivalence in the latter is compensated by the context, so that the Serbian translator obviously relied on the TL reader's knowledge of similar place-name structures in Serbian, e.g. Tomislavgrad, Biograd, Lenjingrad, thus bringing this place-name closer to the TL reader.

*Raventree* (G.R.R. Martin: 511)*Vranino drvo* (T. Pavičević: 620)*Gavrangrana* (N. Pajvančić: 478)

*Raventree* is "a castle in the Riverlands...(it) is ancient, dating back to the days of the First Men. The walls are covered in moss, with a tower at each angle in the wall... Hundreds of ravens roost on the dead weirwood, which is said to have been poisoned by the Brackens, the Blackwoods' ancestral foes<sup>44</sup>." The Serbian translator again follows the well-established pattern of keeping the structure with his *Gavrangrana*. Additionally, with the repetition of the alveolar sound /r/, the pronunciation of the coinage imitates the raven's cawing sound in the TL. The Croatian *Vranino drvo*, with its second word in the multi-word place-name beginning with a lower case letter, implies that the name refers to a tree rather than a castle.

*Riverrun* (G.R.R. Martin: 581) *Rijekotok* (T. Pavičević: 700) *Brzorečje* (N. Pajvančić: 539)

*"Riverrun* is the ancestral castle... situated in the western Riverlands, at the point where the Tumblestone and Red Fork rivers meet."<sup>45</sup> Although Riverrun is the name of a castle, it also describes the area around it. The Croatian *Rijekotok* is a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Lannisport, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2015. Web. 3rd March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Lannisport>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Raventree Hal, *Game of Thrones Wiki*. Web. 3rd March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://gameofthrones.wikia.com/wiki/Raventree\_Hall>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Riverrun, *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2014. Web. 9th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Riverrun>

compound which conveys the meanings of both elements and, as such, is quite acceptable. But, with all the possibilities that the target-language offers, the Serbian translator with his *Brzorečje* also manages to convey that the place is surrounded with more than one river, possibly inspired with the TL nouns like: "otočje", "potočje", "gorje", etc.

Westeros (G.R.R. Martin: 492) Zapadne zemlje (T. Pavičević: 597) Vestros (N. Pajvančić: 461)

This might not be a compound, but it is certainly a good example of two different approaches to its translation - the continent of *Westeros*, where most of the action actually takes place. The translators used two different strategies: the Croatian translation is descriptive, *Zapadne zemlje*, and it conveys the core of information about its location in Martin's fantasy world. On the other hand, the Serbian translation, *Vestros*, is purely orthographic and for the TL reader completely meaningless. Both translations suffer a loss: the Serbian *Vestros*, the loss of meaning, and the Croatian *Zapadne zemlje*, its exotic connotation.

# 2.4. SF characters

In the context of compounding as a structural pattern in the word coinage, it is necessary to mention that G.R.R. Martin uses it as a tool for creation of names for his science fantastical characters specific for the culture of his imagination.

A translator always faces a problem of conveying culture-specific concepts into his/her source language.

"The source-language culture word may express a concept which is totally unknown in the target culture. The concept in question may be abstract or concrete; it may relate to a religious belief, a social custom, or even a type of food."<sup>46</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 21.

A translator's role is to keep balance between the two cultures and, often, this is not an easy task. Especially so in a literary text where she/he is expected not only to convey the source language culture in a manner which is the most comprehensible for the TL reader, but also to be a talented writer paying attention to the style of writing which requires a great deal of talent and inspiration.

When culture-specific concepts are in question, a translator must rely on various sources of information: internet, encyclopedias, or even her/his friends familiar with the source-language culture, in order to obtain the most detailed description of the new concept. Although it is not possible to achieve total equivalence in translation of any literary text, there are various strategies that can be dealt with in obtaining the maximum understanding from the reader.

"No two languages are ever sufficiently similar to be considered as representing the same social reality. The worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not merely the same world with different labels attached."<sup>47</sup>

But, what really happens when the reality a writer describes in his novel is a novelty for both source and target language reader? While the SL reader can rely on her/his own perception, the target-language reader has to look through the eyes of the translator because "the text cannot be considered as a static specimen of language (an idea still dominant in practical translation classes), but essentially as the verbalized expression of an author's intention as understood by the translator as reader, who then recreates this whole for another readership in another culture."<sup>48</sup>

The following examples illustrate to which extent the translators manage to illustrate the common names that the author assigns to some of the fictitious characters in this fantastic society, as well as the composition of the terms they coin in the TL text.

*bloodriders* (G.R.R. Martin: 88) *jahači-pobratimi* (T. Pavičević: 110)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Edward Sapir, quoted in Susan Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edit., (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 217.

#### krvorodnici (N. Pajvančić: 89)

"A bloodrider is a member of a Dothraki Khal's entourage. Part guardian, brother and companion, the bloodriders guard and accompany the khal in his daily routing, they share what is his, sometimes even his wives but never his horse."<sup>49</sup> Bloodriders appear quite often in the novel and the Croatian translator's choice, *jahači-pobratimi*, although perfectly correct, at times seems to be too lengthy and interfere with the rhythm and smoothness of reading. The Serbian *krvorodnici* suffers a loss in meaning (riders) for sake of gaining a more natural expression.

shadowbinders (G.R.R. Martin: 197) istjerivači duhova (T. Pavičević: 243) senkovesci (N. Pajvančić: 189)

"A shadowbinder is a practitioner of magic who binds shadows to do their will."<sup>50</sup> The concept of shadows in the novel does not reflect the concept of ghosts we are familiar with. Shadows are the servants of light and it looks like they come from a parallel world which can be accessed by priestesses and shadowbinders who seek their help in the name of terrible and evil sorceries. The Croatian translator's decision to translate this concept into something the TL reader is familiar with, the concept of ghost busters from the Hollywood movies, certainly leads to misinterpretation of the scenes from the novel the shadows are involved in. On the other hand, the Serbian translator introduces a compound completely new for the TL reader obviously motivated by the fact that the SL reader is facing the same new experience.

godswife (G.R.R. Martin: 562)
božja nevjesta (T. Pavičević: 679)
sveštenica (N. Pajvančić: 524)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2014. Web. 20th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Bloodrider>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2014. Web. 20th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Shadowbinder

"A priestess of the Great Shepherd of Lhazar. They act as healers and midwives."<sup>51</sup> While the Croatian translator tries to be more specific about the term, the Serbian translator simplifies the concept by choosing a word of a more general meaning - "sveštenica". His decision to introduce a concept generally known within the TL readership suffers a loss of the author's intention to create a new, the novel specific.

#### 2.5. Conclusion

Writing about reality as the world of experience, Mona Baker tends to agree with Lowe who states: "by providing man with a certain conceptualization of reality, every language proposes an original, discontinuous vision of the universe of experience. And in a sense, every meaningful unit of a given language participates in some way in the creation of the global mental vision of the world this particular language proposes to its speakers."<sup>52</sup>

The examples above prove that conceptualization of reality can be a rather challenging task. Especially so when a science-fantastical novel reveals a completely new way of expressing and describing the story specific ideas and characters.

The importance of context can be recognized in translation of every single coin, Croatian or Serbian, since they convey not only their meaning, but also, to a higher or lesser degree, their form by using the features of their own languages as tools in word creation.

## 3. Personal names and titles

Writing of foreign personal names in the Serbo-Croatian language had caused two different streams of opinions before the common Serbo-Croatian orthographic manual was finally agreed and published in 1960. The ones who argued that personal names should be written phonetically (*Šekspir*), complained about difficulty to read them in their original form. On the other hand, the ones who advocated their writing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2014. Web. 20th March 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 45.

in the original form (*Shakespeare*), claimed that it was often impossible to recognize a person if their name was written phonetically. The best solution for all was to adopt both ways, so that the Latin alphabet accepted writing of foreign personal names in their original form, and the Cyrillic alphabet advocated that they be written phonetically.<sup>53</sup>

Contemporary Croatian language orthography, which uses Latin alphabet, prescribes that the foreign personal names be written in their original form, whereas the Serbian orthography, which uses both Latin and Cyrillic alphabet prescribes phonetic adjustments in both.<sup>54</sup>

The subject of this chapter is to compare the courses which our translators take in transferring and, where necessary, translating the foreign personal names of the characters in the novel.

A problem in translation appears when the personal names have specific connotations, which is the case with most of the characters in G.R.R. Martin's "A Game of Thrones". The Croatian and the Serbian translations of the novel are mostly congruent, but in some instances, completely different and interesting for analyses in this chapter.

For the beginning, as basis for the analyses, we can take into account the following Peter Newmark's suggestion:

"Normally, people's first and surnames are transferred, thus preserving their nationality, and assuming that their names have no connotations in the text... There remains the question of names that have connotations in imaginative literature. In comedies, allegories, fairy tales and some children's stories, names are translated (e.g., Cendnllon), unless, as in folk tales, nationality is important."<sup>55</sup>

He recommends that "the best method is first to translate the word that underlies the SL proper name into the TL and then to naturalize the translated word

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, op.cit., 219.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Ibid., 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Peter Newmark, *A Textbook of Translation* (Hertfordshire, HaH International vUIO Ltd.: Hertfordshire, 1988.), 214 – 215.

back into a new SL proper name – but normally only when the character's name is not yet current amongst an educated TL readership."<sup>56</sup>

The personal names of G.R.R. Martin's characters reveal their origins, their social positions, life achievements and their heroic or cowardly deeds. With this in mind, translating their names turns out to be a very sensitive issue within the translation process.

As far as it concerns titles, Croatian and Serbian are rather congruent in their orthographic rules: they both prescribe that they be written in lower case (*reis-ul-ulema*, *papa*, *kralj*), with an exemption of capitalizing them in the Croatian language in case they stand on their own and refer to living persons (*Bili su prisutni Kralj i Kraljica*, *Sultan*, *Papa*).<sup>57</sup>

The titles of the characters in the novel, just like personal nouns, require translation and it will be interesting to see to which extent the translators manage to convey the meanings of the titles which actually do not exist in the real world.

#### 3.1. Footnotes

One of the strategies in translation of meaningful proper names are certainly footnotes. A footnote is "a note placed at the bottom of a page of a book or manuscript that comments on or cites a reference for a designated part of the text"<sup>58</sup>, "to which attention is drawn by means of a reference mark in the body of the text"<sup>59</sup>.

It cannot be denied that footnotes are sometimes necessary to explain untranslatable concepts, especially the culture-specific ones, therefore unintelligible for the TL reader. However, most of the sources related to the theory of translation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Ibid. 215.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, op.cit., 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Footnote – definition of footnote by The Free Dictionary, 2015. Web. 19th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt; http://www.thefreedictionary.com/footnote>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 248.

suggest that the footnotes be avoided and, if possible, a short explanation be incorporated into the TL text itself because they disturb the flow of narration.

Mona Baker quotes Thomson's advice about what should or should not be relegated to footnotes in translation:

"The study of implicature may provide a practical solution to the well known problem of deciding what parts of the original shared context should be built into the text of the translation and what should be provided separately, for example in footnotes. *Information essential to the success of conversational implicatures should be included in the text* if the translation is to be coherent and sensible. It is unrealistic and working against the pragmatic nature of language to put such information into footnotes."<sup>60</sup>

But, how do the footnotes work as a strategy in "A Game of Thrones"?

At the Edinburgh international book festival in August 2014., G.R.R. Martin stated:

"I am attracted to bastards, cripples and broken things as is reflected in the book. Outcasts, second-class citizens for whatever reason. There's more drama in characters like that, more to struggle with".<sup>61</sup>

A bastard in G.R.R. Martin's world implies "a person born of unmarried parents; an illegitimate child"<sup>62</sup>. Throughout the novel we are being introduced with several characters who fall into this category, the characters with specific life stories and a specific place in the society. They do not belong to either of the social classes for a simple reason – they originate from noble fathers but commoner mothers, they levitate somewhere in between, they are neither accepted nor rejected by the others. The author gives them special names as if to group them together in a special category in order to distinguish them from the others. Therefore, the translation of their names requires special attention.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> George RR Martin in quotes: 'I love writing about bastards', *The Guardian*, 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014. Web. 9<sup>th</sup> April 2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://theguardian.com/books/2014/aug/11/george-rr-martin-in-quotes-i-love-writing-about-bastards> 62 Random House Webster's Unabridged Dictionary, 2nd edit., 2001, (Random House: New York), 175.

The following examples illustrate the usage of footnotes as a method of translation of personal names which carry connotations important for the context of the novel.

"Do you have a name, child?"

"Mya Stone, if it please you, my lady," the girl said.

It did not please her; it was an effort for Catelyn to keep the smile on her face. *Stone* was a bastard's name in the Vale, as *Snow* was in the north, and *Flowers* in Highgarden; in each of Seven Kingdoms, custom had fashioned a surname for children born with no names of their own. (G.R.R. Martin: 309)

"Imaš li ti ime, dijete?"

"Mya Stone, ako vam je po volji, gospo", reče djevojka.

Nije joj bilo po volji; Catelyn se morala potruditi da zadrži osmijeh na licu. *Stone* bijaše ime kopiladi u Dolini, kao što je *Snow* bilo na Sjeveru, a *Flowers*<sup>2</sup> u Visovrtu; u svakoj od Sedam kraljevina, običaj je oblikovao prezime djece rođene bez vlastita imena. (T. Pavičević: 378)

"Imaš li ti ime, dete?"

"Mia Kamena, ako vam je po volji, moja gospo", reče devojka.

Nije joj bilo po volji; Kejtlin s naporom zadrža osmeh na licu. *Kameni* je bilo prezime za kopilad u Dolu, kao što je *Snežni* bilo na severu, a *Cvetni* u Visokom Sadu. U svakom od Sedam kraljevstava, običaji su stvorili prezimena za decu rođenu bez svojih vlastitih. (N. Pajvančić: 292 - 293)

The Croatian translator retains the original names in the TL text, at the same time providing the TL reader with additional, brief explanations in the footnotes ( $^{2}Stone =$  kamen, *snow* = snijeg, *flowers* = cvijeće). On the other hand, the Serbian descriptive adjectives Kameni, Snežni, and Cvetni follow Newmark's model thus avoiding interruption of the narrative.

The Serbian translation is not deprived of the footnotes either. A good example is the nickname of Lord Frey – the Late Lord Frey.

"The Darrys and Rygers and Mootons had sworn oaths to Riverrun as well, yet they had fought with Rhaegar Targaryen on the Trident, while Lord Frey had arrived with his levies well after the battle was over, leaving some doubt as to which army he had planned to join (theirs, he had assured the victors solemnly in the aftermath, but ever after her father had called him the *Late Lord Frey*." (G.R.R. Martin: 241)

"Darrysovi, Rygerovi i Mootonsi također su prisegnuli Rijekotoku, no oni su se borili uz Rhaegara Targaryena na Trozupcu, dok je knez Frey stigao sa svojom okupljenom vojskom dobrano nakon što je bitka bila završila, ostavljajući mjesta sumnji kojoj se vojsci namjeravao pridružiti (njihovoj, ozbiljno je uvjeravao pobjednike nakon boja, ali otad ga je njezin otac uvijek zvao **Zakašnjeli knez Frey**." (T. Pavičević: 299)

"I Deriji i Rajgeri i Mutoni bili su zakleti na vernost Brzorečju, pa su se ipak kod Trozupca borili na strani Regara Targarjena, dok je lord Frej sa svojom vojskom stigao tek nakon što je bitka odavno završena, ostavivši dosta sumnje u to kojoj je strani zapravo nameravao da se prikloni (njihovoj, najsvečanije je ubeđivao pobednike kasnije, ali ga je od tada njen otac uvek zvao *Pokojni lord Frej\**." (N. Pajvančić: 229)

In the paragraph above, "late" as in "coming, occurring, continuing, or remaining after the correct, usual, or expected time" <sup>63</sup> applied in the Croatian translation *Zakašnjeli knez Frey* perfectly fits into this particular context even without any further explanations. The Serbian translator, on the other hand, makes a couple of obscure decisions by opting for a completely different definition of the word "late" in the TL text – "having died recently"<sup>64</sup> thus having to provide a further explanation in the footnote - "\*Pokojni lord Frej – engleska reč *late* znači zadocneli, zakasneli, ali i pokojni". It is the fact that the context does not imply in any way that Lord Frey is deceased or considered to be dead by any of the characters in the novel, and that the decision brought by the Serbian translator was unnecessary.

## 3.2. Descriptive personal names

The manner in which G.R.R. Martin names his characters in some instances reflects their features or achievements as in the following two examples:

"The Lannisters were an old family, tracing their descent back to *Lann the Clever*, a trickster from the Age of Heroes who was no doubt as legendary as *Bran the Builder*, though far more beloved of singers and taletellers." (G.R.R. Martin: 231)

"Lannisterovi bijahu drevna obitelj, s korijenima koji su sezali sve do *Lanna Lukavoga*, varalice iz Vremena junaka koji je nesumnjivo bio jednako

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Late – definition of late, *The Free Dictionary*, 2015. Web. 19th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.thefreedictionary.com/late>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Ibid.

legendaran kao *Bran Graditelj*, premda znatno manje mio pjesnicima i pripovjedačima." (T. Pavičević: 285)

"Lanisteri su bili stara porodica, poticali su od *Lana Pametnog*, varalice iz Doba junaka koji je, bez sumnje, bio mitska ličnost poput *Brena Zidara*, mada su ga pevači i pripovedači mnogo više voleli." (N. Pajvančić: 219)

Lann the Clever was prone to deceit.

"... in the Westerlands it is more often said that Lann deceived Garth Greenhand by posing as one of his sons – Garth having so many that he couldn't recognize he wasn't one – and making off with part of the inheritance that belonged to Garth's children. One popular story tells how he supposedly swindled Casterly Rock from the Casterlys using nothing but his wits."<sup>65</sup>

The meaning of "clever" is "quick to understand, learn, and devise or apply ideas; intelligent; skilled at doing or achieving something; talented"<sup>66</sup>. Although there are no negative connotations in the definition of the word, the Croatian translator opts for "Lukavi", probably inspired by the word "trickster" which means "a person who cheats or deceives people"<sup>67</sup>.

The negative connotations that the Croatian translator derived from the context and consequently substituted "clever" for "lukav" closely specify the character's wits. The Serbian translation, although it achieves equivalence on the word level, slightly suffers from denotation. Both translations read well in the TL text.

# 3.3. Titles

Being inspired by the medieval England, its royalties and noble families, as well as its squalor and the dirtiest corners of the society, G.R.R. Martin introduces us with his nobilities through already known titles for his characters, but also through new terms with or without meaning in the real world.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Lann the Clever, A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2015. Web. 10th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://awaoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Lann\_the\_Clever">http://awaoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Lann\_the\_Clever</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Apple dictionary /clever/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Apple dictionary /trickster/

Such is the title of "khal" and his "khalasar" which both translators literally transferred into the TL text: the Croatian translator in its original form from the SL text, and the Serbian translator with its phonetic transcription.

"Drogo is so rich that even his slaves wear golden collars. A hundred thousand men ride in his *khalasar*, and his palace in Vaes Dothrak has two hundred rooms and doors of solid silver. "There was more like that, so much more, what a handsome man the *khal* was, so tall and fierce, fearless in battle, the best rider ever to mount a horse, a demon archer." (G.R.R. Martin: 26)

"Drogo je toliko bogat da čak i njegovi robovi nose zlatne ogrlice. Stotinu tisuća muževa jaše u njegovoj *khalasari*, a njegova palača u Vaes Dothraku ima dvije stotine soba i vrata od čistoga srebra." Uslijedilo je još mnogo toga sličnog, o tome kako je *khal* naočit muškarac, visok i vatren, neustrašiv u bici, najbolji jahač koji je ikad uzjahao konja, demonski strijelac. (T. Pavičević: 37)

"Drogo je tako bogat da mu čak i robovi nose zlatne ogrlice. Sto hiljada ljudi jaše u njegovom *kalasaru*, a njegova palata u Ves Dotraku ima dve stotine soba i vrata od srebra." Usladile su mnoge slične priče, o tome kako je *kal* naočit čovek, tako visok i žestok, neustrašiv u bici, najbolji jahač koji je ikada uzjahao konja, nepogrešiv strelac. (N. Pajvančić: 32)

If we take into consideration the strategies that the translators employ, it is obvious that they do not treat *khal* and *khalasar* as loan words but as adopted foreign words from an imaginary language since their definition cannot be found in any of the English language dictionaries. The main difference between foreign and adopted words in linguistics is that the loan words, throughout time, domesticize and become a part of the lexicon of a language, whereas the foreign words never undergo the process, they remain in use during a short period of time, and eventually drop out of use.<sup>68</sup>

The Croatian translator treats the words as foreign by fully adopting their orthographic features, whereas the Serbian translator transcribes them and adjusts them to phonological rules of the Serbian language.

Another interesting example is the title of the king's deputy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Hasnija Muratagić-Tuna, op.cit. 191-192.

"Lord Eddard Stark, I would name you the *Hand of the King*." (G.R.R. Martin: 38)

"Kneže Eddarde Stark, želim vas imenovati *Kraljevim Namjesnikom*". (T. Pavičević: 50)

"Lorde Edarde Stark, hoću da te imenujem za *kraljevu desnu ruku*." (N. Pajvančić: 43)

"Duties of the Hand include commanding the king's armies, drafting laws, dispensing justice, and generally managing the day-to-day running of the kingdom. The Hand may act on the king's behalf when he is indisposed, and sit the Iron Throne while doing so... The office typically makes the Hand the second-most powerful man in the kingdom next to the king..."<sup>69</sup>

The Croatian translation suffers a loss because it is oversimplified by the translation of the title with an already known concept. Additionally, the Croatian language orthographic rules prescribe, as previously mentioned, that the titles be written with their first letters in lower case.

The Serbian translator opts for *kraljeva desnica* in terms of "desna ruka" as a metaphorical expression in the TL for a person who is one's crucial assistant. In this context, it would not be enough to substitute the "hand" with "ruka" because this term does not have any connotations implying the importance of the position from the king's perspective.

And finally, there is a quite ambiguous term related to a title at the court – the title of the master of whisperers.

"Varys the eunuch was the king's *master of whisperers*. He served Robert now as he had once served Aerys Targaryen." (G.R.R. Martin: 93)

"Varys eunuh bio je kraljev *glavni uhoda*. Sada je služio Robertu onako kako je nekoć služio Aerysu Targaryenu."(T. Pavičević: 115)

"Evnuh Varis je bio kraljev *gospodar šaptalica*. Služio je Roberta, kao što je nekada služio Erisa Targarjena." (N. Pajvančić: 94)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Hand of the King, *A Wiki of Ice and Fire*, 2015. Web. 22nd April 2015. <a href="http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Hand\_of\_the\_King>">http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Hand\_of\_the\_King></a>

"Whisperer" derives its meaning from "whisper" as in "a secretly or surreptitiously expressed belief, rumor, or hint"<sup>70</sup>. A whisperer is "a person habitually engaged in idle talk about others"<sup>71</sup>. In the context of the novel, the whisperers report to their master about gossips or rumors they can hear in the streets so that they do not have a permanent engagement in spying on someone or something. Although one would think that the author used this term to create a new category in his society, surprisingly enough, the same term appears in another fictional novel, "Wars of the Roses", written by the English author Conn Iggulden.

"... I cannot say for certain that he is safe here; do you understand me? York has his *whisperers* in as many ears as I have – and a fat purse to bribe weak men..."<sup>72</sup>

A whisperer must not be mistaken for a spy, "a person employed by a state or institution to obtain secret information from rival countries, organizations, companies, etc."<sup>73</sup> Therefore, as compared to the more general term *uhoda* in the Croatian translation, *šaptalica* in the Serbian one seems to be a quite appropriate substitution since it makes a distinction between a spy and a whisperer.

Additionally, the meaning of *master* in the context of the novel, as well as the title *master of whisperers*, implies "an employer of workers or servants". If we analyze it from the grammatical point of view, the *master of whisperers* is clearly a noun phrase consisting of a subject and an object in **of** phrase form.<sup>74</sup> The Serbian translation *gospodar šaptalica* reflects the subject-object relationship of the original, whereas the Croatian *glavni uhoda* places *master* in the position of an adjective in attributive function, as in *master whisperer* (back-translation). One of the features commonly considered to be characteristic of adjectives is that "they can freely occur

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Whisperer, *The Free Dictionary*, 2015. Web. 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.thefreedictionary.com/whisperer>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Conn Iggulden, *Wars of the Roses* (London: Penguin Group, 2014.), 371.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Spy, *The Free Dictionary*, 2015. Web. 23rd April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.thefreedictionary.com/spy>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Marcella Frank, *Modern English: a practical guide*, (Englewood Cliffs, NJ 07632: Regents/Prentice Hall, 1993), 357.

in ATTRIBUTIVE function, *i.e.* they can premodify a noun, appearing between the determiner (including zero article) and the head of a noun phrase:

an ugly painting, the round table, dirty linen"<sup>75</sup>

#### 4. Formal vs. dynamic equivalence

Eugene Nida has introduced the terms of formal and dynamic equivalence in translation studies as two major methods of translation.

"... a formal equivalence translation attempts to reproduce several formal elements, including: (a) translating nouns by nouns, verbs by verbs, etc.; (keeping all phrases and sentences intact (i.e. not splitting up and readjusting the units); and (c) preserving all formal indicators, e.g. marks of punctuation, paragraph breaks, and poetic indentation."<sup>76</sup>

The features of the formal equivalence can be recognized in the Croatian translation of the novel in that the translator is faithful to the grammatical structure and the lexical details of the SL text. What we get as a result are redundant and clumsy sentences, and somewhat stilted utterances, which sound unnatural for the TL reader.

Although Eugene Nida does not categorically rule out the formal equivalence translations and considers them perfectly valid in certain types of messages for certain types of audiences (e.g. "a reader of Plato's Dialogues in English may prefer rigid consistency in the rendering of key terms")<sup>77</sup>, this approach is not acceptable in translation of modern literary texts.

Unlike the Croatian translation, the Serbian translation is oriented towards dynamic equivalence. Nida's brief definition of dynamic equivalence (D-E) is as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Sidney Greenbaum, Randolph Quirk, op.cit., 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Eugene Nida, *Principles of Correspondence. Linguistic and cultural distance*, quoted in Lawrence Venuti, *The Translation Studies Reader* (London and New York: Routledge, 2000), 134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Lawrence Venuti, op.cit. 135.

"One way of defining a D-E translation is to describe it as "the closest natural equivalent to the source-language message." This type of definition contains three essential terms: (1) equivalent, which points toward the source-language message, (2) natural, which point toward the receptor language, and (3) closest, which binds the two orientations together on the basis of the highest degree of approximation."<sup>78</sup>

The following chapter illustrates the strategies which deal with weak lexical items such as verbs *seem* and *make*.

# 4.1. The strength of seem and make in translation

Translation of the copular verb *seem* and the causative verb *make* can be initially analyzed through Firbas' notion of communicative dynamism (CD), whereby

"communicative dynamism... is based on the fact that linguistic communication is not a static, but a dynamic phenomenon. By CD I understand a property of communication, displayed in the course of the development of the information to be conveyed and consisting in advancing this development. By the degree of CD carried by a linguistic element, I understand the extent to which the element contributes to the development of the communication, to which, as it were, it 'pushes the communication forward".<sup>79</sup>

The manner in which the verbs *seem* and *make* contribute to the development of communication in the English language in some contexts requires significant modification of their primary meanings in the TL. The comparison of two different approaches to their translations below show the importance of dynamism in an attempt to achieve the same level of naturalness and acceptability in the TL text.

# <u>Seem</u>

The lordling *seemed not to hear him*. He studied the deepening twilight in that half-bored, half-distracted way he had. (G.R.R. Martin: 2)

Mladi plemić *se doimao kao da ga nije čuo*. Proučavao je sve dublji sumrak napola se dosađujući, a napola rastreseno. (T. Pavičević: 9)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Ibid., 136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 161.

Mladi lord *kao da ga nije čuo*. Proučavao je dolazeći sumrak s mešavinom dosade i ravnodušnosti, baš kao što je činio i sve drugo. (N. Pajvančić: 10)

Or:

"When *I* was a boy," Tyrion replied, "my wet nurse told me that one day, if men were good, the gods would give the world a summer without ending. Perhaps we've been better than we thought, and the Great Summer is finally at hand." He grinned.

The Lord Commander did not seem amused. (G.R.R. Martin: 175)

"Kad sam *ja* bio dječak", odvrati Tyrion, "moja mi je dojilja govorila da će jednog dana, ako ljudi budu dobri, bogovi podariti svijetu ljeto bez kraja. Možda smo bili bolji nego što mislimo, a Veliko je ljeto konačno pred nama." Isceri se.

Vrhovni zapovjednik nije se doimao zabavljenim. (T. Pavičević: 217-218)

"Kada sam *ja* bio dečak", odgovori Tirion, "dojilja mi je rekla da će jednog dana, ako ljudi budu dobri, bogovi dati svetu beskrajno leto. Možda smo bili bolji nego što mislimo i Veliko Leto je konačno pred nama." On se iskezi. Lordu zapovedniku *to nije bilo smešno*. (N. Pajvančić: 169)

The primary meanings of the verb *seem* as it stands alone are:

"seem [si:m] vi (u)činiti se, doimati se kao, biti naoko"<sup>80</sup>

The Croatian translator employs the literal translation of the verb and properly

incorporates it into the context. On the other hand, the Serbian translator opts for its contextual meanings:

"it ~s (to me) čini (mi) se, izgleda (mi); all ~ed pleased svi kao da su bili zadovoljni; I ~ to see (hear) him still (čini mi se) kao da ga još vidim (čujem); he ~s to believe it izgleda da vjeruje; he does not ~ to believe it kao da mu je teško povjerovati; it would ~ to kao da"<sup>81</sup>

and uses them in the TL in order to achieve its readability and naturalness. In the first example, he achieves equivalence both on lexical and contextual level. However, in the second example we can recognize elements of over-translation in the form of paraphrase.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Željko Bujas, Veliki englesko-hrvatski rječnik = English-Croatian Dictionary, (Zagreb: Nakladni zavod Globus, 1999.), 791.
 <sup>81</sup> Ibid.

# <u>Make</u>

"Maybe we'll break you," one of the rapers said.

"Try." Jon reached back for his sword., but one one of them grabbed his arm and twisted it behind his back.

"You make us look bad," complained Toad.

"You looked bad before I ever met you," Jon told him. (G.R.R. Martin: 151)

"Možda ćemo mi slomiti tebe", reče jedan od silovatelja.

"Pokušajte." Jon posegne za mačem, ali ga jedan od njih zgrabi za ruku i svine mu je iza leđa.

"Činiš nas da svi izgledamo loše," potuži se Žabac.

"Izgledali ste loše još prije nego što sam vas sreo", reče mu Jon. (T. Pavičević: 189)

"Možda mi slomimo tebe", reče jedan od silovatelja.

"Pokušajte." Džon krenu da se lati mača, ali ga jedan od njih uhvati za ruku i savi mu je iza leđa.

"Zbog tebe svi izgledamo glupo", požali se Žabac.

"Ti si izgledao glupo i pre nego što sam te ja sreo" reče mu Džon. (N. Pajvančić: 147)

#### Or,

"...You never could lie for love nor honor, Ned Stark. I'm still young, and now that you're here with me, things will be different. *We'll make this a reign to sing of*, and damn the Lannisters to seven hells..." (G-R.R. Martin: 260)

"... Nikad nisi mogao lagati, ni iz ljubavi ni zbog časti, Nede Stark. Još sam uvijek mlad, a sada kad si ti uza me, stvari će biti drugačije. *Učinit ćemo ovo kraljevstvo predmetom pjesama*, i poslati Lannisterove u sedam pakala..." (T. Pavičević: 322)

"... Nikada nisi umeo da lažeš, Nede Stark. Još sam mlad, a sada kada si ti kraj mene, sve će biti drugačije. *O ovoj vladavini će se pevati pesme*, a Lanisteri neka se tornjaju u sedam paklova..." (N. Pajvančić: 247)

The primary meanings of the verb make are:

"**make**<sup>1</sup>, **made**, **made** [meik, meid, meid] *vt* & *vi* činiti, načiniti, učiniti, počiniti; stvoriti, tvoriti; izraditi, zgotoviti, izvesti, proizvesti; sastaviti; pripraviti"<sup>82</sup>

Compared to the Croatian translator's translation of *seem* in the previous example, it can be concluded that the decision is again based on the same strategy of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Ibid., 527.

formal translation whereby a high level of literalness is achieved without losing the meaning of the utterance. The Serbian translator, in the first example, opts for paraphrase. Additionally, in order to preserve the meaning in TL because "izgledati loše" in B/C/S implies bad medical condition, rather chooses to substitute it for *smiješno* and bring the meaning as close as possible to the original. In other words, he opts for naturalness at the expense of accuracy.

In the second example, whether it be on purpose or by mistake, the Croatian translator, besides the literal translation of the verb *make*, completely misinterprets the author's intentions in the complement of the verb because the songs will be sung about their reign and not about their kingdom. The Serbian translator leaves it to the reader to use the power of implication in order to understand that the reign will be sung about because the characters engaged in the dialogue will be involved in it.

#### Seem and make

A roar of outrage drowned out his voice. "*Craven*!" the Greatjon thundered. "Begging for a truce will make us seem weak," declared Lady Mormont. (G.R.R. Martin: 663)

Jeka uvreda zagluši njegov glas. "Kukavico!" grmio je Veliki Jon. "*Moljakanje za primirjem učinit će nas da se doimamo slabima*", objavi kneginja Mormont. (T. Pavičević: 797-798)

Besni pokliči ugušiše njegov glas. "Kukavice!" zagrme Velidžon. "Ako moljakamo za primirje, izgledaćemo slabi", objavi ledi Mormont. (N. Pajvančić: 616)

The example above, more particularly the Croatian translation, demonstrates how literal translation in some instances may produce robust and lengthy sentences which do not contribute to readability of the text in the TL. The Serbian translator, again, chooses to keep the communication channels open by using common TL pattern in translation.

According to Mona Baker "it is certainly true that individual lexical items have little more than a 'potential' for meaning outside text and that their meanings are
realized and can be considerably modified through association with other lexical items in a particular textual environment."<sup>83</sup>

In this case, it is true that the verbs *seem* and *make*, with their primary meanings, have little potential for meaning outside text, but they have a big potential for modifications which are necessary in order to achieve a smooth, readable translation in a given context.

#### 4.2. Damage caused by the formal equivalence translation

The formal equivalence translation of a modern literary text may cause serious damage to the style of the target language text. More precisely, it may produce incoherent and blurred collocations completely foreign to the TL reader.

"A Game of Thrones" is a novel whose network of characters, places, events, and relationships is complicated enough, therefore the contribution of a translator in this case should be that it, at least, reads easily in the TL text. The Croatian and the Serbian translator both successfully fulfill this task if we take into consideration that the novel is a vast creation, which will, eventually, extend to a seven-book saga.

Although the aim of the analyses is not meant to criticize either one of the translators, it appears that the Croatian translator sometimes composes clumsy syntactical constructions being highly influenced by the source language patterning. On the other hand, the Serbian translator opts for free translations in order to avoid complicated expressions.

According to Mona Baker, "linear arrangement, then, has a role to play in processing information and organizing messages at text level. Of the numerous formulations available for expressing a given message, a speaker or writer will normally opt for one that makes the flow of information clearer in a given context. In order to appreciate the factors which motivate a writer or speaker to make this kind of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 206.

selection, one needs to think of the clause as a message rather than as a string of grammatical and lexical elements."<sup>84</sup>

Some of the strategies that Baker suggests in order to minimize linear dislocation are:

- 1. voice change (substitution of active for passive);
- change of verb (involves changing the verb altogether and replacing it with one that has a similar meaning, e.g. *give/get*, *like/please*);
- nominalization (involves replacing a verbal form with a nominal one, e.g. *describe/description*);
- extraposition (involves changing the position of the entire clause in the sentence by embedding a simple clause in a complex sentence, e.g. cleft and pseudo-cleft structures).<sup>85</sup>

Although she is of an opinion that a translator "should make an effort to present the target text from a perspective similar to that of the source text... certain features of syntactic structure such as restrictions on word order, the principle of end-weight, and the natural phraseology of the target language often mean that the thematic organization of the source text has to be abandoned. What matters at the end of the day is that the target text has some thematic organization of its own, that it reads naturally and smoothly, does not distort the information structure of the original..., and that it preserves, where possible, any special emphasis signaled by marked structures in the original and maintains a coherent point of view as a text in its own right."<sup>86</sup>

A few sentences selected as the examples show the damage that formal equivalence may cause in the TL text with special emphasis on the Croatian translation, which contains clumsy and stilted utterances.

At that, the king stirred. "Quiet, woman," he snapped. He straightened in his seat. "I am sorry, Ned. I never meant to frighten the girl. It seemed best to bring her here and get the business done with quickly."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit., 120-121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Ibid., 167-171.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Ibid., 172.

"And what business is that?" *Ned put ice in his voice*. (G.R.R. Martin: 129)

Na to se kralj oglasio. "Tiho, ženo", reče oštro. Uspravi se na svojem stolcu. "Žao mi je, Nede. Nisam namjeravao prestrašiti djevojčicu. Činilo se najboljim dovesti je ovamo i posao obaviti što prije." "A koji je to posao?" *Ned unese leda u svoj glas*. (T. Pavičević: 161)

Na to se kralj promeškolji. "Tišina, ženo, odseče. Ispravi se u stolici. "Žao mi je, Nede. Nisam hteo da uplašim malu. Činilo mi se da je najbolje dovesti je ovde i brzo rešiti stvar."

"A kakvu to stvar?" reče Ned ledenim glasom. (N. Pajvančić: 126)

The example above can also be analyzed through the prism of metaphor and its conceptualization in the process of translation. According to Peter Newmark, metaphor is "the transferred sense of a physical world...; the personification of an abstraction...; the application of a word or collocation to what it does not literally denote, i.e., to describe one thing in terms of another."<sup>87</sup>

In his attempt to show how metaphors reflect cognitive and cultural human experience encoded by language between two culturally distinct languages, English and Arabic, Ali R. Al-Hassnawi incorporates Mandelblit's "Cognitive Translation Hypothesis" which proposes two schemes of cognitive mapping conditions:

- Similar Mapping Condition (SMC) a category that represents metaphors expressing a small number of ideas shared by two languages and hence expressed by similar expressions;
- Different Mapping Condition (DMC) a category that represents culture-bound SL metaphors that are mapped into a domain different from that of the TL.<sup>88</sup>

Al-Hassnawi believes that "attempts of literal rendering or mere linguistic meaning transference of the metaphoric expressions from one language to another are deemed to result in a noticeably bad product, especially when these expressions draw

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Peter Newmark, op.cit., 104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Translation Journal: Ali R. Al-Hassnawi, *A Cognitive Approach to Translating Metaphors*, Vol. 11, No. 3, July 2007. Web, 25th February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://translationjournal.net/journal/41metaphor.htm>

on culture-specific methods or thinking rather than on shared or universal notions or schemata."<sup>89</sup>

If we take into account that *ice* in the English defines as "the solid form of water, produced by freezing; frozen water"<sup>90</sup>, it is easy to understand why ice is used as a metaphor for reserved, formal and cold attitude (*cold* being a metaphor in its own right). In this particular case we are dealing with SMC metaphor, therefore the translators' lexical choice expresses the same idea in the TL.

The Croatian translator, in this case, adheres too closely to the source language syntactical structures thus creating a stilted effect on the TL reader.

## (About poison)

"The tears of Lys, they call it. A rare and costly thing, clear and sweet as water, and it leaves no trace. I begged Lord Arryn to use a taster, in this very room I begged him, but he would not hear of it. *Only one who was less than a man would even think of such a thing, he told me*." (G.R.R. Martin: 270)

"Lyske suze, tako ih zovu. Rijetka i skupa stvarčica, bistra i slatka poput vode, i ne ostavlja traga. Molio sam kneza Arryna da uzme kušača, u ovoj istoj sobi sam ga molio, ali nije htio ni čuti. *Samo bi onaj koji je manji od čovjeka ikad pomislio na takvo što, rekao mi je*." (T. Pavičević: 334)

"Suze iz Lisa, tako ih zovu. Retka i skupocena tvar, bistra i čista poput vode, i ne ostavlja tragove. Preklinjao sam lorda Erina da zaposli kušača hrane, baš u ovoj prostoriji sam ga preklinjao, ali on za to nije hteo ni da čuje. *Tako nešto nije dostojno pravog muškarca, to mi je rekao*." (N. Pajvančić: 256)

The meaning of a *man* in this particular context does not imply "an adult male person, as distinguished from a boy or a woman"<sup>91</sup>, but "a male having qualities considered typical of men or appropriately masculine: *Be a man*"<sup>92</sup>. What the author wanted to say in the original text is that a real man would never think of using poison as a weapon for a murder. In the medieval times, the code of manhood was governed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Translation Journal: Ali R. Al-Hasnawwi, op.cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary of the English Language, (New York: Gramercy Books, 1996), 947.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Webster's Encyclopedic Unabridged Dictionary of the English Language, op.cit. 1166.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Ibid.

by chivalry and honor. Poison is an indirect, dishonorable tool in opposition to straightforward physical combat therefore it is a female weapon, and it is not manly to use it. The author probably got the inspiration from Shakespeare's plays where mostly women appear to be poisoners.<sup>93</sup>

The confusion in the Croatian translation firstly appears because of the translator's failure to find a proper equivalent to *man* in this particular context. "Biti čovjek" in the B/C/S language means to be of a great personality and it may refer to a man as well as to a woman. Since the author wanted to emphasize the fact that poison is a female weapon as opposed to a combat as a male weapon, the word *muškarac* would be more appropriate in this context. Additionally, the sentence structure does not read well in the target language and it suffers a great loss of meaning.

The Serbian translator opts for free translation of the complete utterance failing to achieve equivalence on the word level for the cost of gaining a cohesive structure in the target language without losing the focus of the message.

"Pyp hopped off his horse and looked at the lightening sky with disgust. "Give us a hand bedding down the horses, Sam," the small boy said. "We have a long day before us, *and no sleep to face it on*, thanks to Lord Snow." (G.R.R. Martin: 652)

"Pyp skoči sa svog konja i s gađenjem pogleda sve svjetlije nebo. "Daj nam pomozi, da nastremo konjima stelju, Same", reče maleni dječak. "Dug je dan pred nama, *a nemamo sna da ga lakše podnesemo*, zahvaljujući knezu Snowu." (T. Pavičević: 785)

"Pip veza konja i besno pogleda prve tragove svetla na nebu. "Pomozi nam oko konja, Seme", reče mali momak. "Pred nama je dug dan, *a nismo ni oka sklopili*, zahvaljujući lordu Snežnom." (N. Pajvančić: 605)

The example above is especially interesting in the Serbian translation where the translator decides to substitute the utterance with the target language idiom *ne sklopiti ni oka*. With this strategy, he strengthens the expressive meaning of the utterance thus emphasizing the presence of tiredness and need for rest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Dara Kaye, *The Shakespeare Institute Review. Shakespeare, Death & Mortality*, Volume I – June 2012. Web. 30<sup>th</sup> March 2015

 $<sup>&</sup>lt; https://academia.edu/2568937/Murther_Most_Foul_Poison_as_a_Gemdered_Weapon_in_Shakespeare>$ 

The Croatian translation reads relatively well, although not well enough to sound natural in the target language, which has its own means of expressing the condition (e.g. "nismo se naspavali", "nismo dovoljno spavali" etc.).

### 4.3. Conclusion

According to Dr. Vladimir Ivir, the target language receptor is not interested in the structure of the source text but in its equivalence structured so that it complies with the expressive possibilities and requirements of his/her own language. Therefore, the translation needs to be transparent. <sup>94</sup> In order to achieve brevity and unmarkedness, he suggests substitution of minimal lexical items from the source language text with the minimal lexical items in the target language text, whether they be a single word or a whole stream of words. The translator's failure to do so results in a stretched and less natural style.<sup>95</sup>

As far as it concerns transparency in translation, Walter Benjamin states:

"... as regards the meaning, the language of a translation can – in fact, must – let itself go, so that it gives voice to the *intentio* of the original not as reproduction but as harmony, as a supplement to the language in which it expresses itself, as its own kind of *intentio*. Therefore it is not the highest praise of a translation, particularly in the age of its origin, to say that it reads as if it had originally been written in that language. Rather, the significance of fidelity as ensured by literalness is that the work reflects the great longing for linguistic complementation. A real translation is transparent; it does not cover the original, does not black its light, but allows the pure language, as though reinforce by its own medium to shine upon the original all the more fully."<sup>96</sup>

Mona Baker too advises that carrying over source language patterns be avoided unless there is a good reason for doing so. She also gives the following advice on how to overcome this problem:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Vladimir Ivir, *Teorija i tehnika prevođenja* (Sremski Karlovci: Centar "Karlovačka gimnazija", 1978), 57.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Boris Hlebec, *Opšta načela prevođenja*, 2nd edit., (Beograd: Beogradska knjiga, 2009.), 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Walter Benjamin, *The Task of the Translator. An introduction to the translation of Baudelaire's Tableaux Parisiens*, quoted in Lawrence Venuti, *The Translation Studies Reader* (London and New York, 2000), 21.

"Confusing source and target patterns is a pitfall that can easily be avoided once the translator is alerted to the potential influence that the collocational patterning of the source text can have on him/her. A good method of detaching oneself from the source text is to put the draft translation aside for a few hours. One can then return to the target text with a better chance of responding to its patterning as a target reader eventually would, having not been exposed to and therefore influenced by the source-text patterning in the first place."<sup>97</sup>

Obviously, paraphrase as a strategy in the Serbian translation conforms to the rules of many theoreticians of translation because it preserves the massage of the original text at the same time being faithful to the TL syntactic features. Even John Dryden, one of the greatest English poets of the late seventeenth century, advocated paraphrase as the best strategy to produce faithful translations. Paraphrase, which stands halfway between metaphrase (word-for-word translation) and imitation (free translation), is a free method following the meanings of the author's lexical items rather than their form.<sup>98</sup> Nevertheless, using paraphrase as a strategy in translation may detach the TL text from the SL text thus putting in question the faithfulness of translation, as well as changing the tone of the SL message. The examples above clearly prove that, in some instances, slight rewording and paraphrase may be necessary in order to achieve the *intentio* of the original message.

The reason why the Serbian translator opts for the dynamic translation can be explained in a single sentence:

"That is just the way we would say it".<sup>99</sup>

# 5. Tackling idiomatic expressions

According to Mona Baker idioms are:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit., 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Mehmed Kico, Ogledi u poetici prevođenja: u svjetlu iskustava o arapskome jeziku (Sarajevo: El-Kalem, 2009), 95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Eugene Nida, op.cit., 136.

"at the extreme end of the scale from collocations in one or both of these areas: flexibility of patterning and transparency of meaning. They are frozen patterns of language which allow little or no variation in form and, in the case of idioms, often carry meanings which cannot be deduced from their individual components."<sup>100</sup>

She also states that:

"an idiom may be used in the source text in both its literal and idiomatic senses at the same time. Unless the target-language idiom corresponds to the source-language idiom both in form and in meaning, the play on idiom cannot be successfully reproduced in the target text."<sup>101</sup>

The question is how much freedom a translator can take in translating idioms and idiomatic expressions. Susan Bassnett suggest that:

"... in the process of interlingual translation one idiom is substituted for another. That substitution is made not on the basis of the linguistic elements in the phrase, nor on the basis of a corresponding or similar image contained in the phrase, but on the function of the idiom. The SL phrase is replaced by a TL phrase that serves the same purpose in the TL culture, and the process here involves the substitution of SL sign for TL sign."<sup>102</sup>

The following examples demonstrate to which extent the translators managed to fulfill this task and to which extent the context of the novel affected their choices.

"We have a long ride before us," Gared pointed out. "Eight days, maybe nine. And night is falling."

Sir Waymar Royce glanced at the sky with disinterest. "It does that every day about this time. Are you unmanned by the dark, Gared?"

Will could see the tightness around Gared' mouth, the barely suppressed anger in his eyes under the thick black hood of his cloak. Gared had spent forty years in the Night's Watch, man and boy, and he was not accustomed *to being made light of*. Yet it was more than that. (G.R.R. Martin: 1)

"Dugo je jahanje pred nama", istakne Gared. "Osam dana, možda devet. A pada noć."

Ser Wymar Royce ravnodušno baci pogled prema nebu. "To se događa svakoga dana otprilike u ovo vrijeme. Bojiš li se mraka, Garede?"

Will je mogao vidjeti napetost oko Garedovih usana i jedva suspregnut gnjev u njegovim očima pod debelom, crnom kapuljačom njegova plašta. Gared je

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit. 63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Ibid. 69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Susan Bassnett, *Translation Studies*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edit., (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), 32.

proveo četrdeset godina u Noćnoj straži, kao muškarac i kao dječak, te nije navikao *da ga olako shvaćaju*. Ipak, bilo je tu još nečega. (T. Pavičević: 7-8)

"Pred nama je dugačak put", ukaza Gared. "Osam dana, možda devet. A noć pada." Ser Vajmar Rojs ovlaš i ravnodušno pogleda nebo. "To se dešava svakoga dana u ovo doba. Garede, da se ti ne plašiš mraka?" Vil vide kako se Garedove usne stežu, vide jedva potisnut bes u očima

skrivenim pod debelom crnom kapuljačom njegovog ogrtača. Gared je proveo četrdeset godina u Noćnoj straži, u nju je došao još kao dečak, i nije navikao *da sa njim zbijaju šale*. Ipak, postojalo je tu još nešto. (N. Pajvančić: 9-10)

"To make light of something" is an English idiomatic expression which means "to treat something as if it were unimportant or humorous".<sup>103</sup>

The Croatian translator choses a substitution of the SL idiom for a TL idiom of equivalent meaning: *da ga olako shvaćaju*. This is a completely appropriate strategy, it reads well in the target language, and, most importantly, reflects the mood of the character the paragraph is about.

The Serbian translator derives the meaning of the idiom from the context. Not only that Wymar Royce makes Gared light of, but he also makes fun of him by inserting a humorous remark. The translator's choice of the idiomatic expression in the TL text *da sa njim zbijaju šale*, emphasizes the humorous tone of the paragraph.

Both translators manage to achieve equivalence on the structural level by replacing a SL idiom with a TL idiom, however, the translations have two different connotations altogether. In this particular context, the Croatian translation emphasizes the seriousness of the situation, whereas the Serbian one emphasizes Wymar Royce's funny remark.

"... There are still those in the Seven Kingdoms who call me Usurper. Do you forget how many houses fought for Targaryen in the war? *They bide their time now*, but give them half a chance, they will murder me in my bed, and my sons with me..." (G.R.R. Martin: 95)

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Make light of – Idioms by The Free Dictionary, 2015. Web. 1st April 2015.
<a href="http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/make+light+of">http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/make+light+of</a>>

"Još ih ima u Sedam kraljevina koji me nazivaju Uzurpatorom. Zaboravljaš li koliko se kuća u ratu borilo za Targaryenove? *Sada čekaju pravo vrijeme*, ali dopustiš li im i najmanju priliku, umorit će me u vlastitoj postelji, zajedno s mojim sinovima..." (T. Pavičević: 117)

"... U Sedam kraljevstava još ima ljudi koji me zovu Uzurpatorom. Da li si zaboravio koliko se kuća u ratu borilo na strani Targarjena? *Sada ćute i pognuli su glave*, ali ako im pružiš i najmanju priliku, ubiće me u krevetu, zajedno s mojim sinovima..." (N. Pajvančić: 95)

King Robert Baratheon lives in fear because he took the throne of the Seven Kingdoms by murdering King Aerys II Targaryen who still has his supporters among many noble houses in Westeros. The king thinks that they are patiently waiting for an opportunity to assassinate him.

"To bide one's time" means to "wait for an opportunity"<sup>104</sup>. Since there is no similar counterpart for this idiom in the target language, the translators made two different decisions about which course to take in conveying the meaning of the expression. The Croatian translation, somehow, seems to be out of context and the TL reader might find it hard to understand its reference. The target language expression requires a more specific clarification about what the houses bide their time for. Additionally, King Targaryen's supporters are not waiting for the right time, but for the right opportunity.

The Serbian translation, on the other hand, does not reflect the author's intentions. The translation is slightly exaggerated because *sada ćute i pognuli su glave* means the loss of courage and suggests the feeling of shame, which is not the case in the source language text, so that the translation suffers the loss of accuracy.

The following example illustrates the damage caused by literal translation of an idiom with a misleading meaning.

"The heavy iron-bound door slammed shut. Tyrion heard the rattle of keys. For a small man, he had been cursed with a dangerously *big mouth*, he reflected as he crawled back to his corner of what the Arryns laughably called their dungeon." (G.R.R. Martin: 344)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Bide time – definition of bide time by The Free Dictionary, 2015. Web. 2nd April 2015.<a href="http://www.thefreedictionary.com/bide+time>"></a>

"Teška željezom okovana vrata s treskom se zalupiše. Tyrion začu zveket ključeva.

Za malenog čovjeka, bogovi su ga prokleli opasno *velikim ustima*, pomisli dok je puzao u svoj kutak onog što su Arryni u šali nazivali njihovom tamnicom." (T. Pavičević: 420)

"Teška gvozdena vrata se s treskom zalupiše. Tirion ču škljocanje brave. Moje prokletstvo je što imam mnogo *dugačak jezik* za tako malog čoveka, reče on sebi dok je puzao nazad u svoj ugao onog što su Erini Nazivali tamnicom." (N. Pajvančić: 324)

Tyrion is a witty midget and probably the most humorous character in the whole saga. He is famous for his wisdom and inability to stay quiet even in the most dangerous situations.

The English phrase "to have a big mouth" means to "be loquacious, often noisily or boastfully; be tactless or reveal secrets".<sup>105</sup>

In the target language, whether it be Bosnian, Croatian, or Serbian "to have a big mouth" means exactly what it says: imati velika usta. It is a physical feature, and it can be accepted only with this meaning.

Idioms are lexical units, and although there is zero value correspondence in some cases, the correspondence relationship can be achieved between idioms of two different languages. <sup>106</sup> If a translator fails to recognize an idiom, it leads to misinterpretation like it does, in this particular case, in the Croatian translation.

The Serbian translator manages to find the closest possible equivalent in the target language - the compatible equivalent "imati dugačak jezik". It has a different form, but the evoked meaning is the same as the English "to have a big mouth". Obviously, the Serbian translator discards the source language elements for sake of achieving the "expressive identity"<sup>107</sup> taking advantage of an existing TL idiom.

 $<sup>^{105}</sup>$  Big mouth, have a, Idioms by The Free Dictionary, 2015. Web. 5th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/big+mouth%2c+have+a">http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/big+mouth%2c+have+a</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Boris Hlebec, op.cit., 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Susan Bassnett, op. cit., 33.

The following expression, seemingly an idiom, is another G.R.R. Martin's coinage interesting for analyses in this chapter because it proves the significance of foreignization in particular contextual situations.

"Do you think they'll keep us together? Pyp wondered as they gorged themselves happily.

Toad made a face. "I hope not. I'm sick of looking at those ears of yours." "Ho," said Pyp. "*Listen to the crow call the raven black*..." (G.R.R. Martin: 372)

"Mislite li da će nas ostaviti zajedno?" pitao se Pyp dok su se radosno prejedali. Žabac načini grimasu. "Nadam se da neće. Muka mi je više gledati te tvoje uši." "Oho", reče Pyp. "*Čujte kako se sova ruga sjenici*..." (T. Pavičević: 454) "Šta misliš, da li ćemo ostati zajedno?", upita Pip dok su se veselo gostili.

Žabac se iskrevelji. "Nadam se da nećemo. Muka mi je više da gledam te tvoje uši."

"Opa", reče Pip, "*vidi kako vrana kaže gavranu da je crn*..." (N. Pajvančić: 351)

"The crow call the raven black" only exists in G.R.R. Martin's phantasy world. The author's coinage resembles the form and the meaning of the English idiom "the pot calling the kettle black", "used to claim that a person is guilty of the very thing of which they accuse another."<sup>108</sup> The B/C/S language equivalent in meaning is "rugala se sova sjenici da ima veliku glavu".

What is hiding behind the author's decision to reword the expression and coin the one of his own?

Crows and ravens hold a lot of symbolic value in "A Game of Thrones".

"What do these birds do? First, they can fly, which means they can see the big picture. This is exactly what happens with one of Bran's crow dreams, where he sees the whole world. In fact, it's a wise three-eyed crow that tells him to fly in his coma-dream (18 Bran 3). Crows and ravens are also important in this book for their role as messengers. And finally, "crows" is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> The pot calling the kettle black, Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia, 2015. Web. 6th April 2015. <a href="http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The\_pot\_calling\_the\_kettle\_black">http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The\_pot\_calling\_the\_kettle\_black</a>>

another term that some people use to describe the Night's Watch (61 Jon 8.87), since they dress all in black.<sup>109</sup>

Crows and ravens are associated with Bran's mystical abilities, communication, and the Night's Watch.

The role of these birds in the saga is too great to be neglected in this expression. Although the Croatian translation *rugala se sova sjenici* reads perfectly well in the target language, and most importantly conveys the meaning of the author's intentions, it loses the symbolism hidden behind the crows and the ravens. The Serbian translator relies on the reader's extralinguistic experience and her/his knowledge of the fact that both birds are of the same color, thus preserving the author's allusions. He also relies on the fact that the reader is already introduced with the role of the crows and the ravens at this stage of the book, and translates the expression quite literally.

And finally, the examples below demonstrate two completely acceptable translations of the English idiom "to take heart".

Lord Tywin Lannister, the richest and the most influential lord in the Kingdom is losing a battle. He is explaining to his son Tyrion the hopelessness of his situation on the battlefield. As always, Tyrion would not miss a chance to mock him, and reminds him of past Prince Rhaegar Targaryen, who would have been the Lord's biggest enemy if he were alive.

Tyrion smiled crookedly. "*Take heart*, Father. At least Rhaegar Targaryen is still dead." (G.R.R. Martin: 642)

Tyrion se iskrivljeno osmjehnuo. "*Glavu gore*, oče. Barem je Rhaegar Targaryen još uvijek mrtav." (T. Pavičević: 773)

Tirion se iskrivljeno osmehnu. "*Ne daj se*, oče. Bar je Regar Targarjen još uvek mrtav." (N. Pajvančić: 596)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Crows and ravens, *SHMOOP University*, 2015. Web. 6th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;http://www.shmoop.com/game-of-thrones-book/crows-ravens-symbol.html>

"Take heart" means "be confident, be brave, as in *Take heart, we may still win this game*. This idiom uses *heart* in the sense of "courage".<sup>110</sup> What Tyrion wants to tell to his father is to be courageous (budi hrabar), but at this stage of the novel a reader already knows that "Tywin is a calculating, intelligent, politically astute, ruthless, and controlling man. He dedicates his life and efforts towards maintaining the Lannisters' prestige, and ensuring House Lannister is respected, or at least feared. He is a proven battle commander and politician, and has a very powerful presence combined with an intimidating gaze."<sup>111</sup>

What our translators deduct from the context is the fact that there is no much point in telling such a strong and power hungry character to be courageous, therefore both of them choose much better options which are more acceptable for a TL reader. Also, there is an element of sarcasm in the statement which is an important indicator in this specific father and son relationship. In the target language, "budi hrabar" would carry much stronger connotations than "glavu gore" or "ne daj se" since it is used as encouragement for a weak and cowardly person, which is not the case with Lord Tywin Lannister.

### 5.1. Conclusion

All idioms in all languages bear non-linguistic or extra-linguistic meanings. Some of them have quite transparent meanings but they are sometimes culturespecific and extremely hard to convey. According to Mona Baker "the main problems that idiomatic and fixed expressions pose in translation relate to two main areas: the ability to recognize and interpret an idiom correctly; and the difficulties involved in rendering the various aspects of meaning that an idiom or a fixed expression conveys into the target language."<sup>112</sup>

Susan Bassnett seems to be of a similar opinion because she believes that "translation involves far more than replacement of lexical and grammatical items

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Take Heart – Idioms by The Free Dictionary, 2015. Web. 6<sup>th</sup> April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt; http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/take+heart>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Tywin Lannister – A Wiki of Ice and Fire, 2015. Web. 6th April 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt; http://awoiaf.westeros.org/index.php/Tywin\_Lannister>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Mona Baker, op.cit., 65.